



Communication and Community Participation: Focus on the Role of NGOs in Pakistan

Received: 13-Oct-20 | Accepted: 13-jan-2021

Mumtaz Ali,¹  Maya Khemlani David,²  Pasand Ali Khoso,³  Sadaf Kashif,⁴

Abstract

The purpose of this research is to determine the role of communication in NGOs in Pakistan and to discuss the participation by the community. The investigation has been made from the perspective of academicians, regulatory body officials, social activists, and communication and development professionals. To achieve this purpose, ten in-depth face to face interviews were conducted with selected respondents. This study provides guidelines for development professionals and non-government organizations (NGOs) who work to improve the life of marginalized communities through social services. The results are hoped to be beneficial for both NGOs and communities. The information obtained can generate further discussion among communication and development practitioners. The paper also provides information for further studies on community cohesion and presents strategies for dealing with communication and community participation problems in development projects.

Keywords: NGOs, Communication, Community Participation, Pakistan, Community Development

Author's Affiliation:


Institution: | University of Sargodha,^{1,2-3} | Iqra University, Islamabad Campus,^{1,2-3} |

Country: | Pakistan

Corresponding Author's Email: *Khoso.pasand@gmail.com

The material presented by the author(s) does not necessarily portray the view point of the editors and the management of the ILMA University, Pakistan.

2707-8906 (Print) ©2020, published by the ILMA University, Pakistan.

This is open access article under the  license. <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/>

1) INTRODUCTION

‘Social problem’ is described as any situation that affects the society (Strier, 2009). The reasons for the development of social problems in detail are yet unclear and therefore the perception and consequences of such social problems vary (Colmen, 2003 p.33). Various segments of the society are affected by some of these problems while some consequences can be beneficial to others (Colmen, 2003 p.34). However, poverty is considered as one of the major social problems in the world and this leads to widening income differentials in society. The global report of UNDP (2012) on poverty indicates that “More than 80 percent of the world’s population live in countries where income differentials are widening”. Several studies highlight the issues related to population growth and increasing poverty have left developing countries to rely on aid from international donor agencies (Saw and Kesavapany, 2006). However, Susanne and Haggis Jane (2002) argue that development needs should not fulfilled only through international aid but civil society and government have a responsibility to take mass initiatives and sustain community development programs to eradicate poverty and build self-reliant societies.

NGOs, being the key contributors to social change should mobilize communities and be involved in development initiatives. Multi-sectoral community development programs are needed to be implemented in rural areas and make efforts to minimize the gap between haves and have nots. To develop self-reliant societies governments are responsible to build knowledge-based economies and NGOs should pursue community participatory community development programs so that existing problems can be resolved.

Community participation and communication are interlinked with each other and are the key functions for any organization. There is a strong need for NGOs to concentrate on increasing the participation of members of the community in their projects. At present community participation has drawn the attention of policy makers, practitioners and professionals working in the development sector. Several studies have claimed that without community participation, NGOs face various difficulties while implementing their projects (Nour, 2011).

This paper discusses the importance of communication and community participation in development projects implemented by NGOs in Pakistan.

2) PAKISTAN AND SOCIAL PROBLEMS

According to the census report the population of Pakistan is 207,774,520, and Pakistan is considered a developing country (Pakistan, 2017). At present, the rapid rate of growth of the population is one of the major challenges. the country is trying to cope with (Shela and Carole, 2011). However the country is ranked as fifth most populous one in the world (UNDP, 2012). Demographers have indicated serious concerns and comment that if measures are not taken to control population growth rate, Pakistan could be the third most populous country in the world by 2050 (Tariq,

2011). The country is facing challenges due to scarcity and mismanagement of resources and if the population keeps on increasing various other problems will emerge (Rukanuddin, Ali et al., 2007; Rende, 2011). Poor health infrastructure, poor living standards, lack of education, improper sanitation and lack of clean drinking water are the main issues of the country (Memon, Joubish et al., 2010).

3) NOTION OF COMMUNITY

The notion of community is difficult to understand and it has no any definite definition but many social scientists describe it as a group of people who live together (Strier, 2009; Claire, Donald et al. 2008). However, Flo and Anne (1999) contend that physical location means people living in specific locations. According to Marshal 2009 however, a community which has similar/common features and characteristics even though they may be living in different sites/locations can be deemed a community.

4) COMMUNITIES IN PAKISTAN

Pakistan is a multi-lingual, multi-cultural and multi-ethnic Muslim country where 95% of the population is Muslims and 5% follow other religions (Pakistan, 2017). Traditionally, family values are highly respected and although the trend among urban communities is moving towards nuclear families, due to socio-economic constraints in the rural areas of Pakistan and due to regional tribal customs dating back thousands of years the joint family system still exist and dominate Pakistani society (Memon, Joubish et al., 2010; Information, 2012; Global, 2012; Talbot, 2011).

5) PROCESS OF DEVELOPMENT IN NGOS

Community development is a challenge that requires change in values, attitudes and structures. Development relates to the enhancement of the capacity of nations, organizations and individuals to utilize the available resources for economic growth and human capital arrangements (Njoh, 2002; Krishnamurthy and Sandra, 2009). In fact, community development is an organized procedure that forces organizations and NGOs to have firm prerequisites. The NGOs generally follow systemic approaches to ensure community participation.

6) COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN DEVELOPMENT PERSPECTIVE

The concept of participation is not new. Community participation refers to the accountability of the beneficiary and an effective flow of information and resulting in enhanced service (Burger, 2012). Several strategies for community participation have been implemented in development projects and such participation is taken as an important instrument in rural development programs.

7) COMMUNICATION IN ORGANIZATIONS

Generating understanding between the originator and receiver is called the process of communication (Angus, Sally et al., 1993). In organizations human resource is the most valuable asset and it cannot live without socialization and communication. Communication among human beings is a rich combination of body movement, symbolic interactions and facial expressions (Winston, 2008 p.78; Armstrong, 2001).

Schultz and Mogens (2000) mention that four elements are most important in communication in organizations: constituencies, constituency responses, message and the organization itself. Better communication is an indicator of a functional organization and organizations face various problems if they are not able to manage effective communication (Ellen, 2001).

8) NON-GOVERNMENT ORGANIZATIONS (NGOS) AS KEY PLAYERS IN THE DEVELOPMENT SECTOR

Organizations with specified structures and defined roles work to achieve their collective goals. NGOs are a type of organization that focus on the charitable and developmental needs of people in the society (David and Wayne, 2003). Different types of NGOs exist ranging from welfare donor, supporting and development organizations. Vidhu (2002 p.23) says NGOs fall in the category of civil society organizations and explains that NGOs are separate entities having independent structures, working systems, specific goals and are formed voluntarily by individuals to serve society and maintain organizational values.

9) ROLE OF NGOS IN PAKISTAN

Different types of organizations operate in Pakistan and include voluntarily based organizations, societies, foundations, trusts and political non-governmental organizations (Van Domelen et al., 2003). Currently the NGOs are registered under five different legislative acts; Societies Act, Social Welfare Act, Trust Act, Cooperative Act and Companies Act to serve the underprivileged communities in poverty, health, social mobilization, capacity building and other social development projects (PCP, 2012).

The welfare/charitable-related organizations are engaged in food distribution, managing orphanage centers, elderly homes and provision of ambulance services along with small welfare projects (Salim, Sadruddin et al., 2011). With the passage of time the right based organizations have also been increased beside a few play their part as think tank groups including Islamabad Policy Research Institute (IPRI), Sustainable Development & Policy Institute (SDPI) and Institute for Science and International Security (ISIS) (Shireen, 2008).

NGOs are also operating projects to provide health services, clinics, schools, hospitals, vocational training centers, child development centers, micro credit projects and capacity building programs and these include a few leading

organizations like Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund (PPAF) Health And Nutrition Development Society (HANDS), Rural Support Program Networks (RSPN) (Shela and Carole, 2011).

It is noticed that most organizations prefer working in rural rather than urban areas. Perhaps the donor agencies are more concerned with the rural or neglected areas. In urban setups generally the basic facilities are already available. It is noticed that in Pakistan most NGOs face high level of criticism by the people due to their luxurious working style yet the role of NGOs cannot be denied.

The purpose of this study is to determine the nature and degree of communication and knowledge sharing in NGOs and to determine the community participation mechanism with project beneficiaries in community development programs. It is our premise that effective communication helps to mobilize members of the community and ensures their involvement. In this study the focus is on communication as a means to ensure community participation.

10) AIM OF THE STUDY

The main aim of the research was to obtain information on various communication channels that are used by NGOs in community services. Further, the study examines the ways these NGOs dealt with communities and explored the level of trust of the communities in the NGOs; and determined the level of cooperation among communities or resource sharing practices in NGOs' projects and the level of response that the NGOs get from their respective communities.

11) RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Qualitative research method is generally used in social science research. Conducting the interviews with respondents comprises an extensive variability of multiplicity of forms (Kvale and Brinkmann, 2009). A questionnaire was developed for participants or key informants (KIs). The items in the questionnaire were discussed with field experts. A pilot interview was conducted with two Key Informants (KIs). As a result of these pilot trials the questionnaire was revised and a final questionnaire and the interview guide were developed.

A list of communication experts, regulatory authorities, activists and community development professionals (Key informants) was prepared. Purposive data collection method was used in the study. Therefore the experts were selected on the basis of specified criteria (refer to Table 01).

Community development is a vast field of study and expertise. Thus, while conducting Key Informants interviews with every respondent had to be relevant and informative. They were contacted through emails/phone calls and briefed on the purpose of the study. A total of 22 experts in the field were contacted. Six refused to participate, two confirmed but afterward they did not participate and four experts could not spare the time for the interview. Finally ten key informants were interviewed. The interviews were conducted with their consent, and according to

their convenience and availability.

12) Sample size

The sample size of the study and details of the respondents are shown in Table 1.

Table 1 Distribution of the Sample

S/#	Category	Method	Instrument	Total
01	NGO heads/executives	Purposive	Questionnaire	02
02	Social Activists			02
03	Experts on Community Development Field / Academicians			02
04	Experts on organizational Communication			02
05	Officers from the regulatory authorities			02
Total respondent				10

13) INTERVIEW PROTOCOL:

In-depth interviews were conducted in Health And Nutrition Development Society (HANDS), Civil Society Organizations Resource Center (CSORC), Karachi Rural Network (KRN), Foundation of Research and Community Empowerment (FRCE), Community Development Department (CDD), Social Welfare Department (SWD) Govt. of Sindh, University of Sindh and University of Karachi. Qualitative data were collected during the interviews with the use of an open ended questionnaire. The interviews were also recorded.

Six of the participants were male and the rest were female. Initially, interviewees were again briefed about the study so that they could become informed about the theme of study. Then in order to follow the ethical consideration of the study a consent form was filled and signed by each participant. Later on they were asked to introduce themselves and provide a brief introduction including educational background, current position, and length of work experience in communication and community development sectors. This information helped in understanding the interviewee’s personal and professional background in detail. Then the respondents were asked to respond to the questions.

There were 12 open ended questions. The majorly of the questions were about communication, community participation, project sustainability and viable communication models in the development sector. The responses were recorded, transcribed and analyzed.

14) DATA ANALYSIS

Researchers selected the key informants on the basis of their qualifications and expertise. Further details can be seen in Table 1. Before selecting the respondents their professional background and expertise were reviewed carefully. The

interviewees are described as Key Informants.

Domicile of Key informants

All participants of the study were selected from Sindh Province of Pakistan, where one of the researchers lives.

1.1) ROLE OF NGOS IN COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT:

Seven out of the ten respondents mentioned that the role of NGOs cannot be denied in Pakistan. The NGOs are playing a big part in different fields including health, education, poverty alleviation, social mobilization and advocacy for human rights. They further said that NGOs contributed a lot in raising awareness on issues of social change. The role of NGOs is :-

Extract 01..... “Government should be strong enough and play its part to resolve the community issues rather than NGOs are doing so”. (Interview Key Informants - 09, 02nd July 2019).

Extract 02.....“NGOs are working as active part of civil society and they are trying to become the alternate of the government in Pakistan. Such kind of approach does not suit NGOs in any country. There is a strong need to create a climate of cooperation so the government and NGOs can complement each other’s work and perform mandatory role together” (Key Informants – 03, 30th May 2019).

1.2) COMMUNITY’S RESPONSE:

Six participants praised the community’s response to NGOs intervention. They also gave few examples relating to the projects which are implemented in some parts of the country, where community’s response is very positive. Respondents mentioned that:

Extract 03..... “If the NGO has good reputation and image then only communities gives positive response and participate in NGOs’ projects (Key Informants - 03, 30th May 2019).

Extract 04..... “When community responses and works for NGO, the experience shows that few NGO spoil communities and they misuse villagers for their own interests (Interview Key Informants - 07, 19th June 2019).

1.3) KNOWLEDGE SHARING WITH COMMUNITIES:

The response on knowledge sharing with communities revealed that most of the respondents said that it was important for any organization to share clear information with all stakeholders. However, in this study the eight respondents held the same view that effective communication strategy and knowledge sharing mechanism enhances cooperation and trust between the community and a NGO. The respondents mentioned that:

Extract 05..... “Interaction among the employees working together and communities living in one village already have linkages with each other. Generally they perceive that each one is well known to each other. Hence, they don’t give importance to the sharing of knowledge and information, that’s why the mechanism cannot become effective. I suggest despite they know everything but still sharing is significant” (Key Informants - 06, 13th June 2019).

1.4) IDEAL COMMUNICATION SYSTEM IN NGOS:

The respondents had different opinions regarding communication flow in development organizations as can be seen in the extracts below

Extract 06..... “The flow of communication is an important factor for any organization. The communication system must be based on multiple approaches such as horizontal and vertical, top-down and bottom- up” (Key Informants - 02, 26th May 2019).

Extract 07..... “Quality tools for communication i.e. management information system, right to access of knowledge, quality data system, Emails and online video conferencing are the main components of information sharing and these lead to make effective communication” (Key Informants - 10, 15th July 2019).

Extract 08..... “The communication flow is a two way process. NGOs alone are not answerable to share the knowledge and information but community members are equally responsible to do the same. NGOs might have been equipped with plans, project activities, and grip on approaches but unless the community would not have shared information about their customs, culture, language, community relations and traditions this two way flow cannot be strengthened” (Interview Key Informants - 05, 09th June 2019).

In the light of the responses by participants, the effective communication really seems to be a huge challenge. NGOs should therefore see it as a key function in their standard operation procedures (SOPs) to manage organizations.

1.5) COMMUNICATION GAP:

Six of the respondents agreed that communication between the NGO and community works when it is conducted effectively. However, communication gap create many problems in organizations. It happens when the employees and other stakeholders like communities are not guided and facilitated properly. Communication system in NGOs should be clear.

Respondents said that:

Extract 09..... “Mostly NGOs avoid to share complete project data i.e. budgets, financial reports and critical findings with the communities. They produce excuses that sharing complete project knowledge is against their organizational confidentiality policy.

(Interview Key Informants - 08, 25th June 2019).

Extract 10..... “About 55000 NGOs are registered in Pakistan, only few organizations are known to public while the rest remain out of the screen because of this communication gap. (Interview Key Informants - 07, 19th June 2019).

Extract 11..... “Proper communication is very essential for sustainable development. Mostly communication exists during project activities only and it is lost as the project duration ends”. (Interview Key Informants - 09, 02nd July 2019).

Extract 12..... “Some NGOs maintain the communication deliberately only in order to achieve targets and project deadlines. This happens mostly in donor-focused interventions (Interview Key Informants - 05, 09th June 2019).

1.6 IMPROVEMENT IN COOPERATION DUE TO BETTER COMMUNICATION:

All the participants were of the view that communication creates an environment of trust and cooperation:

Extract 13..... “Government should play its role in increasing cooperation among NGOs in Pakistan. Networking, social interaction, joint forums and legislative authorities can be used as a tool for increasing cooperation. This would have better results in social development process. (Interview Key Informants - 04, 05th June 2019).

Extract 14..... “Better communication and increased cooperation are important for achieving mutual goals and objectives” (Interview Key Informants - 01, 23rd May 2019). .

1.7 RESOURCE SHARING:

All participants emphasized and categorically specified that resource sharing is one of the most important indicators of community participation and empowerment. Participants responded that:

Extract 15..... “There are few successful stories in Pakistan, such as AKRSP in Northern Pakistan, HANDS in Sindh and OPP in Karachi regarding the resource sharing models by community. (Interview Key Informants - 08, 25th June 2019).

Extract 16..... “Resource sharing is considered as a solid foundation for development process in any community; without resource sharing any NGO and community mean nothing to each other (Interview Key Informants - 03, 30th May 2019).

Extract 17..... “Resource sharing is linked with the high level of trust that a community has on any particular NGO” (Interview Key Informants - 10, 15th July 2019).

Extract 18..... “Sense of community ownership in NGO’s projects can be evaluated and enhanced through resource sharing in the development projects. Strong social mobilization in communities is important to produce better results in ensuring community participation” (Key Informants - 04, 05th June 2019).

Resource sharing does not mean that people share their resources in cash or kind. Time and energy of the community member is also considered as an important resource. Therefore, if community members give their time it must be understood that this is also an important resource which is shared.

1.8) PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY:

All respondents agreed that the sustainability of any project is one of the biggest issues in the community development sector. They mentioned that the sustainability of a project depends on greater participation by community members in development initiatives.

Extract 19..... “If community realizes that the project is theirs, it’s for them and they have to take it as their own program then only the sustainability of projects can be ensured. Such kind of approach enhances the chances to sustain the project (Interview Key Informants - 09, 02nd July 2019).

Extract 20..... “Generally, communities do not own interventions once the project ends. Experience shows that most of the projects could not sustain due to lack of proper community participation. The participation is required on each phase of project implementation” (Key Informants - 03, 30th May 2019).

Extract 21..... “Various successful projects can be seen with sustainability in Northern areas of Pakistan. Evidently, where strong social mobilization process took place, the probabilities of project sustainability are increased when community is fully motivated” (Key Informants - 06, 13th June 2019).

Sustainability of the projects should be addressed at the initial stage during implementation. However, generally NGOs discuss the matter of project sustainability and motivate communities when the projects are coming to a completion.

1.9) EXPERT OPINION FOR IMPROVING OF ROLE OF NGOS:

Nine out of the ten respondents proposed the need for NGOs to have a more active role in terms of providing relief services to marginalized communities. They suggested executing community empowerment initiatives with community partnership.

Extract 22..... “NGOs should focus on increased community participation. They should rely on local resources, having the philosophy of self-help, and development oriented approaches that can make the role of NGOs more effective” (Key

Informants - 02, 26th May 2019).

1.10) BEST METHODS FOR COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN DEVELOPMENT ACTIVITIES:

All the participants responded positively in using the following factors for ensuring community participation in development process:

Knowledge and information sharing

Consultation

Deciding together

Acting together

Supporting independent community interests

While commenting on aforesaid factors practice in NGOs in Pakistan, eight participants responded that most of the NGOs do not follow any framework and do not have any knowledge and training about such participation models. Two respondents mentioned:

Extract 23..... “Only few NGOs in Pakistan follow these steps to ensure community participation in their programs” (Interview Key Informants - 03, 30th May 2019).

Extract 24..... “In ideal circumstances these steps can be ensured. But with respect to Pakistan’s working environment it is very tough to follow these steps. The given targets by the donor agencies need to be achieved in short period of time. Hence in such kind of situations makes impossible to ensure above suggested measures for increasing community participation” (Interview Key Informants - 04, 05th June 2019).

1.11) CRITICISMS:

Three participants stated corruption as the main reason to criticize the NGOs. Two out of ten participants also said:

Extract 25..... “Largely, media and sometimes government criticize NGOs’ work (Interview Key Informants - 07, 19th June 2019).

Extract 26..... “Generally there is no criticism on NGOs but public tends to criticize those NGOs that hide information and do not pursue community participation process properly (Interview Key Informants – 10, 15th July 2019).

1.12) HOW NGOS CAN PLAY AN EFFECTIVE ROLE IN PAKISTAN:

Respondents stated that NGOs can only play their part effectively when they work for communities with honesty and dedications. The community should be considered as a key stakeholder rather than seen bey the NGO as a weak segment of the society. Two out of ten respondents commented that:

Extract 27..... “Community’s involvement in planning and implantation,

information and knowledge sharing, and focusing on community needs can make the NGOs' role more operative (Interview Key Informants - 01, Pakistan, 23rd May 2019).

Extract 28..... “The plans of NGOs should be based on development oriented and they are supposed to encourage communities to increase their participation. That’s how NGOs can enhance their role in society” (Interview Key Informants - 07, 19th June 2019).

15) DISCUSSION

At present Pakistan appears as a state with many social problems. The government needs the support of civil society. NGOs should help the government to find solid solutions to existing issues of development. ‘Indeed, development implies a shift in the capacity of individuals, organizations and nations to use resources effectively and in a way in which they can be utilized’ (Paul and Ilona 2010 p.83). The concept of participation is a key function of community development projects ‘Effective community development most often happens when community members are aware of their powers to act together and benefit their community’ (Rule and Kyle, 2008 p.294). This can happen when proper communication and notion of genuine community participation prevails.

Various scholars have mentioned that understanding the problems of any society is not easy and government itself is not the only responsible party to solve these problems, but civil society itself is equally responsible to solve such problems. In community development process the perception and consequences of experts and the community may vary (Colmen, 2003 p.97).

NGOs can be one of the sources to address and fix community problems in efficient ways. Cooperation among the state, NGOs and community is an important factor to improve the quality of life of the common people. Sustainable development can not only come through international aid, but it can materialize when civil society and government take mass development initiatives and sustain community development programs (Susanne and Haggis Jane, 2002).

NGOs being key contributors should take the lead to support the government where the state faces difficulties. In these circumstances two factors are essential: communication and community participation. Cooperation and mindset to help each other can only be enhanced when effective communication takes place and community participation is ensured. Due to the importance of these issues, all NGOs should see them as a priority area in their development projects.

Participants of the study realized the positive role of NGOs in community development sector in Pakistan. They mentioned that NGOs are working well and are trying to resolve the community development issues as an alternative to government departments. Further, they suggested that government and NGOs should play their part together.

Information and knowledge sharing are the key components of community participation. Despite the NGO leadership knowing the importance of information sharing, the system lacks this component in NGOs. Thus, the study suggests to improve the information and knowledge sharing system the communication system must consist of essential and multiple approaches i.e. horizontal and vertical, top-down and bottom-up flow of knowledge and information. Management information system needs to be improved. Easy and effective two way communication should be practiced in the organizations.

Respondents showed great concern that NGOs mostly avoid sharing project data, budget, financial statements and critical research findings with the communities and say that they follow information disclosure policy. More than 55000 NGOs are registered in Pakistan but only few are known to the public while the rest remain fairly invisible because of the communication gap. Better communication also creates close interaction between the government and NGOs. Good networking, social interaction and joint forums can be used as effective tools for increasing cooperation.

Resource sharing was found as a big challenge by the community members in development projects. This reflects that strong mobilization should be fulfilled. Mostly NGOs implement their projects without real community participation process which makes projects unsustainable. However, the study found that sustainability of a project depends on fair participation by community members in development initiatives. Evidence from the data shows that generally, communities do not own the NGOs' projects during implementation, so once a project ends sustainability of the project does not appear feasible and consequently billions of rupees are wasted in the name of community development programs. Hence, NGOs should focus on applying effective communication and consider the importance of community participation.

In short, in Pakistan, voluntary associations, welfare organizations, Not-for-profit Organizations and NGOs have an important role, but the benefits of their work are limited. A strong flow of communication and better coordination between the NGO and the community can be a possible solution to improve the progress of the NGO and also to contribute to the lives of the people.

16) CONCLUSION

In general poor linkages among community, NGOs and government's social policies were viewed as one of the great concerns of the respondents. NGOs need to ensure community participation in development process through participatory measures including: knowledge and information sharing, consultation, deciding together, acting together and supporting independent community interests. Based on the findings of this study only few NGOs practice these steps to ensure community participation. Effective communication increases the trust between an NGO and its community. Based on the perception of the key informants in this research currently the NGOs are on the giving and communities are on the receiving end of the continuum. Unless the reciprocal approach is used in the development projects

the desired outcomes will not materialize.

Currently communities rely only on receiving resources rather than sharing their own resources. There is therefore a need for NGOs to enhance the sense of ownership through strong interaction and effective communication. Indeed, this will produce better results in ensuring community participation. Few respondents also mentioned that when everything is provided by the government itself so the public do not see a reason to share their resources in projects implemented by NGOs.

Pakistani NGOs are facing much criticism by the common people, particularly the religious communities. This is noted in the media as well. NGOs should therefore review their communication strategies, specifically their system of community participation to cope with such criticism. The findings of this study suggest that NGOs should play their part in terms of services they offer to communities. More community participation, reliance on local resources, philosophy of self-help, and development focused approach can make the role of NGOs more effective and visible. Community's involvement in planning and implantation, information and knowledge sharing, and emphasis on community needs should be strengthened. The study advocates increased cooperation as an important factor for achieving mutual goals and objectives. However, this only can be achieved when NGOs use effective communication as an instrument for increasing community participation.

In closing it must be admitted that the sample was small with only ten respondents. Future studies can encompass a larger sample base. However, the selection of participants in this study represented the views of NGOs' heads, academicians, communication experts, social activists and higher officials of regulatory authorities. The subjects reacted to the interview protocol based upon their own personal expertise, experience working in NGOs, qualification and employment in regulatory authorities of provincial governments in Pakistan.

17) REFERENCE

- Angus, R., S. Sally, et al. (1993). Dictionary of HRD. Hampshire, Gower Publishing Limited.
- Armstrong, M. (2001). A handbook of Management Techniques London Jogab Oage Kunuted.
- Burger, R. (2012). "Reconsidering the Case for Enhancing Accountability Via Regulation." VOLUNTAS: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations 23(1): 85-108.
- Claire, C., C. Donald, et al. (2008). "Building communities of educational enquiry." Oxford Review of Education 34(2): 217-235.
- Colmen, J. (2003). Social Problems A Brief Introduction New Jersey Pearson Education, Inc.

- David, C. S. and H. Wayne (2003). *Civil Society in Asia*. Hampshire, ASHGATE.
- Ellen, A. B. (2001). *Principles of Management*. New York, Hungry Minds, Inc.
- Flo, F. and S. Anne (1999). *The Community Development Handbook a tool to build Community Capacity Alberta*, Learning and Development Canada.
- Global, I. (2012). *Poverty in the world*, Global Issues. 2012.
- Information, G. o. P. M. o. (2012). "Pakistan Profile." Retrieved 15th July 2012, 2012, from <http://www.infopak.gov.pk/BasicFacts.aspx>.
- Krishnamurthy, S. and C. D. Sandra (2009). "Extending cultural horizons: Political economy and public relations." *Public Relations Review* 35(2009): 368-375.
- Kvale, S. and S. Brinkmann (2009). *Interviews; Learning the Craft of Qualitative Research Interviewing*. California, SAGE Publication Inc.
- Marshall, G. (2009). *The concise Oxford Dictionary of Sociology*. New York, Oxford University Press.
- Memon, G. R., M. F. Joubish, et al. (2010). "Education in Pakistan: The Key Issues, Problems and the New Challenges." *Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research* 6(6): 672-679.
- Njoh, A. J. (2002). "Barrier to community participation in development and planning; lessons from the Mutengene (Cameroon) self-help water project." *Community Development Journal* 37(3): 233-248.
- Nour, A. M. (2011). "Challenges and Advantages of Community Participation as an Approach for Sustainable Urban Development in Egypt." *Journal of Sustainable Development* 4(1): 79-91.
- Van Domelen Dongier J. Ostrom, E. R. A. Wakeman, et al. (2003). *Community driven development In The PRSP Sourcebook* Washington, DC, World Bank.
- Pakistan, P. C. O. G. o. (2017). "Population of Pakistan." Retrieved 10th July 2019, from <http://www.census.gov.pk/>.
- Paul, H. and V. Ilona (2010). *Community Development and Civil Society; Making connection in the European Context*. Portland, The Policy Press.
- PCP (2012). "NGO Regulations System in Pakistan." Retrieved 13th July, 2018, from <http://pcp.org.pk>.
- Rende, S. and M. Donduran (2011). "Neighborhoods in Development: Human Development Index and Self-organizing Maps." *Social Indicators Research*.

- Rukanuddin, R. J., T. S. Ali, et al. (2007). "Midwifery Education and Maternal and Neonatal Health Issues: Challenges in Pakistan." *Journal Midwifery Womens Health* 52(4): 396-398.
- Rule, A. C. and P. B. Kyle (2008). "Community-Building in a Diverse Setting." *Early Childhood Education Journal* 36(4): 291-295.
- Salim, L., S. Sadruddin, et al. (2011). "Organizational Commitment in a Health NGO in Pakistan." *VOLUNTAS: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations*.
- Saw, S.-H. and K. Kesavapany (2006). *Malaysia Recent Trends and Challenges*. Singapore, Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.
- Schultz, M. J. H. M. and H. L. Mogens (2000). *The Expressive Organization: Linking Identity, Reputation, and the Corporate Brand*. New York, Oxford University Press Inc.
- Shela, A. A. H. and K. Carole (2011). "International Column: Effects of Humanitarian Emergencies on Newborn and Infants' Health in Pakistan." *Newborn & Infant Nursing Reviews* June(2011): 56-59.
- Shireen, M. H. (2008). *Income Inequality and Poverty in Malaysia*. Maryland, Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.
- Strier, R. (2009). "Community Anti-Poverty Strategies: A Conceptual Framework for a Critical Discussion." *British Journal of Social Work* 39: 1063-1081.
- Susanne, S. and HaggisJane (2002). *Development A Cultural Studies Reader*. Malden, Blackwell Publishing.
- Talbot, I. (2011). *Pakistan: A modern History*. London, Amazon.
- Tariq, M. A. U. R. and N. van de Giesen (2011). "Floods and flood management in Pakistan." *Physics and Chemistry of the Earth, Parts A/B/C*.
- UNDP (2012). *International Human Development Report*. New York, UNDP.
- Vidhu, V. (2002). *Malaysia State and Civil Society in Transition*. London, Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc.
- Winston, R. (2008). *Illustrated Encyclopedia of the Human* Singapore Dorling Kindersley Limited.
-